

MARKETS COMMITTEE

Wednesday, 27 January 2016

Minutes of the meeting of the Markets Committee held at Committee Rooms, 2nd Floor, West Wing, Guildhall on Wednesday, 27 January 2016 at 11.30 am

Present

Members:

John Scott (Chairman)	Michael Hudson
James Tumbridge (Deputy Chairman)	Deputy Jamie Ingham Clark
Alex Bain-Stewart	Professor John Lumley
Deputy John Barker	Wendy Mead
Chris Boden	Deputy Joyce Nash
Deputy John Chapman	Graham Packham
Karina Dostalova	Deputy Dr Giles Shilson
Alderman John Garbutt	Angela Starling
Deputy Stanley Ginsburg	Patrick Streeter
Deputy Brian Harris	

In Attendance

Officers:

Fern Aldous	- Town Clerk's Department
Natasha Dogra	- Town Clerk's Department
Stephen Chandler	- City Surveyor's Department
Andrew Crafter	- City Surveyor's Department
Paul Hickson	- Comptroller and City Solicitor's Department
Debbie Howard	- Chamberlain's Department
Julie Smith	- Chamberlain's Department
David Smith	- Director, Markets and Consumer Protection
Matthew Hill	- Superintendent, Smithfield Market
Malcolm Macleod	- Superintendent, Billingsgate Market
Robert Wilson	- Superintendent, New Spitalfields Market
Ben Milligan	- Markets and Consumer Protection Department
Donald Perry	- Markets and Consumer Protection Department

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received from Nicholas Bensted-Smith, Tom Hoffman, Ann Holmes, Edward Lord, Alderman Julian Malins, Chris Punter, Elizabeth Rogula, James De Sausmarez, Ian Seaton, David Thompson and Mark Wheatley.

It was noted that a clash of Grand Committee meetings with the Board of Governors of the City of London School for Girls had meant that five members had had to submit apologies for one of the two meetings. The Town Clerk explained that the meeting of the Board of Governors of the City of London

School for Girls had been moved from its original date, and apologised that the conflict had not been recognised sooner.

2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

There were no declarations.

3. PUBLIC MINUTES

The public minutes of the meeting held on 30 November were approved as a correct record.

4. FREQUENCY OF MEETINGS AND TERMS OF REFERENCE

A report of the Town Clerk regarding the Terms of Reference and frequency of meetings of the Committee was considered. In response to a discussion on the wording of the role of the Committee (as laid out in Point A of the Terms) the Chairman clarified that the phrase "oversight of" had been added as it was not felt that the Committee had responsibility for the "management of" the markets named.

In response to a query by members, the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection clarified that the governance review had recommended that it be within the remit of the Committee to be responsible for the appointment of the Director's position. The Chairmen of the three committees for which the Director had responsibility would sit on the appointment's panel, with the Chairmanship of the panel and overall oversight being within the remit of the Market's Committee.

RESOLVED – That:

- a) the Terms of Reference of the Committee be approved for submission to the Court, as set out at Appendix A, and that any further changes required in the lead up to the Court's appointment of Committees be delegated to the Town Clerk in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman; and
- b) Members agree that the frequency of meetings per annum be arranged in consultation with the Chairman, Deputy Chairman and the Director of Markets & Consumer Protection, in order for them to align with the anticipated work programme for the year

5. COMMUNITY SAFETY ACCREDITATION SCHEME

The Committee received the minutes of the meeting on the Community Safety Accreditation Scheme. The Chairman and Deputy Chairman noted two errors, the first being the exclusion of traffic as one of the deciding factors behind the decision reached and the second being a change to the last sentence of the minutes to reflect the fact that a review had indeed taken place. The final sentence to read:

"and that, having reviewed their position, the cost/benefit analysis does not support the City being part of the Scheme".

RESOLVED – That the Town Clerk for the meeting be notified and the minutes corrected.

6. MARKETS BUSINESS PLAN UPDATE PERIOD 2 2015/16 (AUGUST - NOVEMBER)

The Committee received a report of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection updating them on the progress for Period 2 2015-16.

The Deputy Chairman questioned whether consideration had been given to encouraging a move from diesel to electric forklift trucks and it was clarified that the Tenant's Associations were already considering the issue; any move having to first seek their agreement.

Members further queried whether there was potential for more parking space to be added to the Billingsgate Car Park to improve revenue and reduce the waiting list for spaces. It was felt that the oversubscription could be capitalised on to allow an increase in parking fees. In response the Superintendent detailed that the fees for the car park were reviewed annually and that there was not any potential for more spaces to be added on the ground floor level. A multi-storey option had been considered however this was not found to present value for money. A trial of allowing patrons to pay for parking via mobile had been undertaken but again had not been successful as it had not allowed for active monitoring of car park capacity. Spaces did become available outside of trading hours. It was advised that the additional income generated from Car Parking would be itemised at the next meeting of the committee.

The length of time taken by MITIE to monitor and fix repairs was discussed. The Superintendent reported that since more control had been handed to officers MITIE were performing however their response times did continue to pose a risk.

The Director of Markets and Consumer Protection confirmed in relation to a question from a member that he was confident all cases of long and short term sickness were being handled appropriately.

The Deputy Chairman queried the reference to a group from New Zealand having visited the market and it was clarified that the group were farmers from the region on a study tour.

The Chairman asked that the wording of the New Spitalfields Market risk identified on Page 23 of the report be changed to reflect the fact that accidents had already begun reducing. He also clarified that the red rating assigned to the risk associated with the HGV Banksman's duties had now been downgraded to amber.

The Deputy Chairman updated the committee on a site visit he had conducted with the Minister for Communities and Local Government. They had discussed the potential move of the Museum of London to that site and it was reported

that the minister seemed to indicate that such a move would be seen as positive.

RECEIVED.

7. **SMITHFIELD MARKET CHRISTMAS TRAFFIC PLAN REVIEW**

The Committee received a report of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection reviewing the Christmas Traffic Plan. The Chairman thanked the former Chairman of the Committee, Hugh Morris, for undertaking to assess the situation. The findings from his review had found the scheme to be generally successful, with the only issue being that the barriers being kept down seemed to slow traffic. This was in contrast to the view quoted from the Indigo Car Parking Manager, and the reasoning behind his views would be investigated.

In response to a query from a member the superintendent confirmed that the management of the Tesco deliveries would be reviewed.

RECEIVED.

8. **RISK REGISTER**

The Committee received a report of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection updating them on changes to the Risk Register.

There was a discussion on the Red Risk associated with the Workplace Traffic Management and it was agreed that any action that could be taken, both long and short term was vitally important to reduce the risk to market users. Measures that were discussed that could be introduced included requiring the trucks to be certified, establishing one training provider for certification of drivers and the trial of barriers in certain areas. It was noted however that the responsibility for the training, management and supervision of Forklift Truck Drivers lay with the individual businesses which employed them. It was further felt that although the risk may be reduced by preventative action, it was incorrect to say that the impact of such an accident taking place could also be reduced.

RESOLVED – That the report be noted.

9. **SUPERINTENDENTS' ORAL UPDATES**

The Chairman moved that Item 18 – Superintendents Oral Update be moved from the Non-Public to the Public section of the meeting.

Smithfield

The Superintendent reported that the traders had experienced a successful Christmas trading period, with the next large occasions anticipated being Valentine's Day and Easter. A paper on car parking charges during the Easter period would be presented to the next meeting of the committee

Spitalfields

The Superintendent reported that trade had been heavy over the Christmas period (although less than in the previous year). A review of the car parking

charges would be carried out as the parking was currently free to users. A more sophisticated barrier entry system would form part of the review.

It was noted that the waste management contract would be due for renewal in 18 months time. The self-surrender scheme had been introduced to deal with increased volumes of waste that had not formed part of the original contract and discussions were ongoing with the tenants association in relation to the scheme.

The Committee were also informed that a number of staffing challenges had arisen, concerning confrontational behaviour towards enforcement officers.

Billingsgate

The Superintendent reported that at Christmas congestion building up around the site was a feature at Christmas. The wholesalers were guaranteed a spot in the main car park; however retail buyers often had to be redirected to the Hertsmere Road Car Park, around half a mile from the site. The Superintendent will consult the central team that have been involved in the Smithfield Christmas traffic plan to see what if any improvements can be made to traffic management at Billingsgate. It was reported that the Chief Fish Inspector of the market would be retiring soon and the Committee wished to express its gratitude for the work that he had done.

10. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

A question was asked regarding the formulation of any policy for moving Smithfield Market from its present site. The Chairman reminded Members of our statutory duty to provide a market and that any change of this policy could take place only after proper consultation with all the stakeholders.

11. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT

The Committee thanked Robert Wilson Superintendent, New Spitalfields Market for his hard work and dedication to the Market and wished him well on his retirement.

12. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED – That under Section 100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraph 3 of Part I of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act as follows:-

Item	Paragraph
13	1, 3 & 5
14	3
15	1 & 3
16	5
17	3, 5 & 7
18	1 & 3

13. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES**
The non-public minutes of the meeting held on 30 November were considered and approved as a correct record.
14. **GATEWAY 5 - POULTRY MARKET (ASBESTOS REMOVAL WORKS)**
The Committee considered a report of The City Surveyor seeking approval for Gateway 4 of the Poultry Market Asbestos Removal Project.
15. **SMITHFIELD MARKET - POULTRY MARKET LETTING OF FIRST FLOOR OFFICES**
The Committee considered and approved a report of the City Surveyor seeking approval for the grant of a lease for First Floor Poultry Market.
16. **SMITHFIELD MARKET - CONDENSER WATER COOLING SYSTEM - UPDATE**
The City Surveyor was heard regarding the Condenser Water Cooling System at Smithfield Market.
17. **DEBT ARREARS MARKETS - PERIOD ENDING 31ST DECEMBER 2015**
The Committee received a report of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection updating them on the Debt Arrears for period ending 31st December 2015.
18. **TENANCIES AT WILL AND ASSIGNMENTS**
The Committee received a report of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection updating them on the Tenancies at Will granted in the period to 31 December 2015.
19. **NON PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**
The Superintendent responded to a query regarding the Self Surrender Scheme
20. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREE SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED**
The Committee noted details in regards to an upcoming committee visit.

The meeting ended at 1.30 pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Gemma Stokley
tel. no.: 020 7332 1407
gemma.stokley@cityoflondon.gov.uk